CALGARY ASSESSMENT REVIEW BOARD **DECISION WITH REASONS**

In the matter of the complaint against the property assessment as provided by the Municipal Government Act, Chapter M-26, Section 460, Revised Statutes of Alberta 2000 (the Act).

between

Shannon I. Krasman, COMPLAINANT

and

The City Of Calgary, RESPONDENT

before

Lana Yakimchuk, PRESIDING OFFICER Allan Zindler, MEMBER John Mathias, MEMBER

This is a complaint to the Calgary Assessment Review Board in respect of a property assessment prepared by the Assessor of The City of Calgary and entered in the 2011 Assessment Roll as follows:

ROLL NUMBER:

034503722

LOCATION ADDRESS:

108 3907 3A Street NE

HEARING NUMBER:

60950

ASSESSMENT:

\$279,500

This complaint was heard on July 26, 2011 at the office of the Assessment Review Board located at Floor Number 4, 1212 - 31 Avenue NE, Calgary, Alberta, Boardroom 1.

Appeared on behalf of the Complainant:

Shannon Krasman, complainant

Appeared on behalf of the Respondent:

Kevin Buckry, City of Calgary Assessment Business Unit

Procedural Matters:

The Respondent, Mr. Kevin Buckry, asked that all seven hearings scheduled for Boardroom 1 on July 26, 2011 for 3907 - 3A St. NE be considered together. The complainants who were present agreed. Evidence from Complainants and the Respondent for files 60950, 61312, 61313, 61444, 61447, and 61449 was considered together.

Property Description:

108 3907 – 3A Street NE is a condominium Industrial-Retail property. This unit has 961 square feet of Ground Warehouse space. The building is woodframe construction and backs into a hill so all doors are on the front face.

Issues:

(3. An assessment amount.) The issue is that the assessment has increased significantly and is not in keeping with market value.

Complainant's Requested Value: \$190,000

Board's Reasons for Decisions in Respect of Each Matter or Issue:

The complainant, Ms. Krasman, said that the assessment of \$279,184 was above market value. She had listed her property for sale in January, 2010 at \$235,000 and was unable to sell it over the 4-month listing time. She relisted it in August, 2010 for \$229,000, hoping to get \$190,000 to \$200,000. It was removed from listings in January, 2011, unsold. She is now renting it to the current user for \$8.50/square foot.

Ms. Krasman presented a list of sales, noting that the comparables were cinderblock buildings and the building in question is wood construction.

She also pointed out that one of the comparables on the respondent's list was 210 3907 - 3A Street NE, a unit in the same building as hers. She noted that the information presented by the respondent was wrong, as the unit that sold for \$450,500 included units 210 and 212, which are connected. Therefore the sale included a total of 2189 square feet.

The respondent, Mr. Buckry, questioned the comparability of some of the list of sales as the

buildings listed were older than the one being reviewed. In response to questions, he stated that there is no allowance for the difference between wood frame and concrete buildings. He said that he had not seen the subject building.

The Respondent listed nine comparable sales which ranged between \$124 and \$224 per square foot. He agreed that the December, 2008 sales comparable within the same building was in error and should be listed at \$450,500 for 2189 square feet or \$205.80/square foot.

Units within the subject building have been assessed between a low of \$242 to a high of \$374 per square foot (please see Industrial Condominium Equity Comparable Chart presented by City of Calgary).

It is the decision of the Board that these assessments are above and outside the demonstrated sales range, especially as demonstrated by the most recent sale of two units within the same building. This indicates over-assessment.

The Board found a value based on the best evidence of sale: the sale of units 210 and 212 within the same building at \$205 per square foot in 2008. Applying the city time adjustment of 97.7% for December, 2008 as shown in the sales evidence for #2, 4505 -12 Street NE (also listed in the Respondent's comparables), the time adjusted sale value is rounded to \$200/square foot.

Board's Decision:

Assessment is reduced to \$200/square foot or (\$192,200 truncated) \$192,000.

DATED AT THE CITY OF CALGARY THIS 39 DAY OF August 2011.

Lana Yakimchuk

Presiding Officer

APPENDIX "A"

DOCUMENTS PRESENTED AT THE HEARING AND CONSIDERED BY THE BOARD:

NO.	ITEM
1. C1 2. R1	Complainant Disclosure Respondent Disclosure

An appeal may be made to the Court of Queen's Bench on a question of law or jurisdiction with respect to a decision of an assessment review board.

Any of the following may appeal the decision of an assessment review board:

- (a) the complainant;
- (b) an assessed person, other than the complainant, who is affected by the decision;
- (c) the municipality, if the decision being appealed relates to property that is within the boundaries of that municipality;
- (d) the assessor for a municipality referred to in clause (c).

An application for leave to appeal must be filed with the Court of Queen's Bench within 30 days after the persons notified of the hearing receive the decision, and notice of the application for leave to appeal must be given to

- (a) the assessment review board, and
- (b) any other persons as the judge directs.